3008.1 E

Canadian Centre For Foreign Policy Development

Centre canadien pour le développement de la politique étrangère

INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM ON HATE ON THE INTERNET

-Executive Summary and Recommendations-

September 1997

Institute for International Affairs, League for Human Rights and B'NAI BRITH CANADA

125 promenade Sussex Drive, Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0G2
Telephone/Téléphone : 613 944 8278 Fax/Télécopieur : 613 944 0687
www.cfp-pec.gc.ca

103-07668/

INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM ON HATE ON THE INTERNET

-Executive Summary and Recommendations-

September 1997

Institute for International Affairs, League for Human Rights and B'NAI BRITH CANADA

International Symposium on
Hate on the Internet

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Toronto, Ontario
Sunday, September 7 - Tuesday, September 9, 1997

B'NAI BRITH CANADA

Institute for International Affairs
League For Human Rights
in co-operation with
B'NAI BRITH INTERNATIONAL

SYMPOSIUM PLANNING COMMITTEE

Co-Chairs
Dr. Lawrence Hart, National Chair, Institute for International Affairs
Rochelle Wilner, National Chair, League for Human Rights

Programme Committee
David Matas (Chair)
Joel Cuperfain — Ian Freedman
Evan Leibovitch — Susan Kadis
Ken McVay — Evan Ross

Local Arrangements
Marina Fink (Chair)
Laura Jacob
Rebecca Redstone

Communications
Jerry Rose
Steven Mock

B'nai Brith Canada
Lyle Smordin, National President
Frank Dimant, Executive Vice President
Pearl Gladman, National Director, Field Services

B'nai Brith International
Moishe Smith, Chair, International Council
Warren Eisenberg, Executive Director, International Council

Staff
Lisa Armony, National Director, Institute for International Affairs
Dr. Karen Mock, National Director, League for Human Rights
Sharon Anisman — Joyce Aster
Ellen Drazner — Natasha Greenberg
Talia Klein — Sharon Laredo (Intern)

Acknowledgements

We gratefully acknowledge the generous financial assistance of our funders:

Multiculturalism Programs, Department of Canadian Heritage
Department of the Solicitor General of Canada
Canadian Centre for Foreign Policy Development
Department of Justice Canada
Ontario Ministry of the Solicitor General and Corrections
Anti-Racism, Access and Equity Centre, Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto
B'nai Brith Canada Foundation

Special thanks are also due to Detective Margo Boyd and Detective Dino Doria, Metropolitan Toronto Police; Councilor Bev Salmon, Charles Smith and Cassandra Fernandes of the Metro Access and Equity Centre; Ken McVay, Director, Nizkor Project; Aaron Moscoe, President, The Promotional Specialists; and the Young Leadership Network of B'nai Brith Canada for their valuable support and assistance.

International Symposium on
Hate on the Internet

PROGRAMME OVERVIEW

SUNDAY, SEPTEMBER 7, 1997

12:00 - 2:00 p.m. Registration
Foyer, B'nai Brith Canada,(BBC) National Office, 15 Hove St., North York

2:00 p.m. Opening Plenary – *Main Auditorium, BBC National Office*
THE PROBLEM AND WHAT SHOULD WE DO ABOUT IT?

7:30 p.m. Opening Ceremonies and Reception
Rotunda, Metro Hall, 55 John Street

8:00 p.m. Program –"THE WEB OF HATE"

Dessert and Coffee

MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 8, 1997

8:30 a.m. Registration and Coffee
Gibson Room, Novotel North York, 3 Park Home Ave., North York

9:00 a.m. REGULATING THE INTERNET: SHOULD WE? COULD WE?
Gibson Room, Novotel North York, 3 Park Home Ave., North York

10:30 a.m. Refreshment Break
Rose Room B, Memorial Hall, North York City Hall

10:50 a.m. Concurrent Seminars, *Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*

Seminar 1– Legal/Legislative Issues, *Gold Room A*
Seminar 2– Technical Issues, *Rose Room A*
Seminar 3– Philosophical Issues, *Gold Room B*

12:30 p.m. Lunch – *Burgundy Room, Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*
Guest Speaker: Professor Deborah Lipstadt, Emory University
"HOLOCAUST DENIAL: AT THE CENTRE OF THE WEB OF HATE"

PROGRAMME OVERVIEW

MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 8, 1997

2:00 p.m. LOOKING FORWARD: INITIATIVES FOR A NEW MILLENIUM
Concurrent Workshops, *Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*

2:30 p.m.
Workshop 1 – Grassroots Strategies to Deal With Hate, *Gold Room A*
Workshop 2 – Creating Communities and Promoting Intercultural Understanding, *Rose Room A*
Workshop 3 – Is the Medium the Message?, *Rose Room B*
Workshop 4 – The New Rhetoric of Hate, *Gold Room B*
Workshop 5 – Police/Prosecutors Training Session (closed session)
Duncan Room, 2nd floor, Novotel North York

7:30 p.m. PUBLIC FORUM –*Council Chambers, North York City Hall*
Moderator: Neil MacDonald, CBC Newsworld

TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 9, 1997

8:30 a.m. Coffee and Tea, *Burgundy Room, Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*

9:00 a.m. Plenary– *Burgundy Room, Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*
DEVELOPING STRATEGIES FOR ACTION

9:30 a.m.
1. Roundtable deliberations on priority issues and recommendations for action *(Rooms to be assigned)*
2. Practical Training for Police Officials (closed session)
Sheppard Room, 2nd floor, Novotel North York

10:30 a.m. Refreshment Break, *Burgundy Room, Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*

12:00 p.m. NETWORKING LUNCH, *Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*

2:00 p.m. Closing Plenary – *Burgundy Room, Memorial Hall, North York City Hall*

AGENDA FOR ACTION: GLOBAL PROBLEMS, GLOBAL SOLUTIONS

Closing Remarks and Appreciation

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

B'nai Brith Canada hosted an International Symposium on Hate on the Internet from September 7-9, 1997 in Toronto, Canada. One hundred invited participants, including government and police officials and representatives of the fields of law, human rights, computer technology, academia, education, and community action, engaged in an in-depth exploration of hate on the Internet for the purpose of drafting recommendations designed to counter this growing phenomenon. The participants gathered from across Canada and from the United States, England, Germany, Israel and Australia for this unprecedented, three-day event.

Background and Purpose

The International Symposium on Hate on the Internet was planned and implemented under the auspices of the Institute for International Affairs and the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada. The Institute for International Affairs has a mandate to protest the abuse of human rights throughout the world and to advocate on behalf of Jewish communities in distress worldwide. It alerts government and community officials of threats to human rights worldwide and assists in policy development. The League for Human Rights is dedicated to combatting racism and bigotry in all their forms. The objectives of the League include improved community relations, the elimination of racial discrimination and anti-Semitism, and the promotion and protection of human rights for all Canadians.

Several years ago, B'nai Brith Canada's Annual Audit of Anti-Semitic Incidents highlighted the issue of hate on the Internet, and the threat it poses to human rights, thereby bringing the issue to the attention of the Canadian government as well as the international human rights arena. Alerted to this growing problem, the membership at the 1995 Annual Meeting of B'nai Brith Canada unanimously passed a resolution to create a joint task force of the Institute for International Affairs and League for Human Rights. The purpose of the task force was to monitor hate on the Internet, with a view to proposing effective guidelines to the CRTC and other relevant government agencies, and to developing educational anti-hate materials to counter the impact of hate on the Internet.

The tremendous increase in hate propaganda on the Internet since that time and the lack of a systematic, structural and inter-jurisdictional approach to hate speech on the Internet were the driving forces behind the organization of the International Symposium on Hate on the Internet. The past few years have marked a dramatic increase in the use of electronic technology throughout the world. Ironically, hate mongers were among the first to realize the tremendous power of the computer to spread their hatred without boundaries. While the Internet is an important tool for the promotion of human rights and democratic values on a global scale, its abuse by hate mongers and extremists gives them a degree of influence that far outweighs their numbers. The League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada, as well as the Hate Crimes Unit of the Metropolitan Toronto Police, and the Anti-Defamation League in the United States have all attributed the recent decrease in overt anti-Semitic incidents and hate/bias crime to the rise of hate on the Internet, as it has replaced some of the

more traditional forms of hate propaganda, threats and vandalism, in keeping with the new strategy of "leaderless resistance" by hate mongers.

While police units at various levels of government have begun to implement strategies to counter traditional forms of hate and bias crime, the development of expertise and the collection of information on hate on the Internet has not been widely successful. At present, the Canadian legal system as a whole lacks a consistent and coordinated approach to this increasing problem. At the international level, there are disagreements as to how the transmission of hate can be curtailed, or even if it should be curtailed at all. This lack of coordination renders minority communities vulnerable to the propaganda of racist groups and individuals, the kind of rhetoric that has been shown to lead directly to violence. There is also confusion over legal jurisdiction when it comes to the new computer technology. Further, no clear organizational system exists to provide a vulnerable community with the information and expertise it requires to respond effectively to threats hurled towards them through cyberspace. Accordingly, B'nai Brith Canada determined the time had come to convene legal, technical and human rights experts from across Canada and abroad, in order to determine the nature and extent of the problem, to evaluate the applicability of current legislation and international conventions, and to begin to draft policies and positions that would be helpful to political decision makers determined to curb the spread of hate and violence.

The primary purpose of the symposium was to explore the problem of hate on the Internet as thoroughly as possible from a variety of philosophical perspectives and professional approaches in order to develop a series of recommendations designed to counter this growing problem and to assist in policy development. The symposium was also intended to set the framework for ongoing national and international cooperation on this issue.

Program and Format

The Planning Committee, consisting of B'nai Brith Canada leadership and representatives of interested agencies and organizations, determined that the most effective format for the symposium would be one in which delegates convened as active participants in a series of working seminars. Therefore, plenary panels provided overviews of the issues and served as the catalyst for discussion; but the symposium consisted primarily of workshops and working sessions in which participants acted as both teachers and learners as they shared their experiences, knowledge and skills in recognizing, monitoring and countering hate on the Internet. The symposium thereby provided an environment conducive for trading ideas, developing working relationships, building skills and communication networks, and planning ongoing liaisons and future coordinating efforts.

All working sessions were designed to further the symposium's goal of improving the levels of effective legal/legislative and community response and international cooperation in countering hate propaganda and Holocaust denial on the Internet. These sessions allowed for in-depth explorations of the nature and extent of hate on the Internet, how existing laws are most effectively applied and how they compliment human rights, community, and educational initiatives, and what practical and viable alternatives to legislation are available

at the international, federal, local and grassroots levels. Recognized experts in their fields presented in each of the sessions. Participants selected the workshops in which they wished to participate based upon their skills and areas of expertise and/or the skills and knowledge which they sought to develop.

The symposium got off to a lively start with the opening plenary, "The Problem and What Should We Do About It?" An international panel of experts representing a spectrum of philosophical and legal perspectives discussed various approaches, some diametrically opposed, to dealing with hate on the Internet. This "fireworks" panel highlighted the key issues explored throughout the symposium and set the tone for the lively discussions over the next two days. The opening reception was co-hosted at Metro Hall by the Anti-Racism, Access and Equity Centre of the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto. Delegates were welcomed by the leadership of B'nai Brith Canada and B'nai Brith International and by dignitaries representing the local, provincial and federal governments. The Secretary of State for Multiculturalism and Status of Women, the Hon. Hedy Fry, brought greetings from the Government of Canada and announced that nineteen federal departments and agencies are currently working on an action plan to fight hate and bias crime, including hate on the Internet. Participants and guests at the reception were treated to an informative and graphic presentation by Ken McVay of the Nizkor Project, and David Hoffman of the Anti-Defamation League, entitled "Web of Hate," an audio-visual demonstration of numerous hate sites on the World Wide Web.

Day Two began with a plenary panel of legal and technical experts examining the issues involved in regulating the Internet, including challenges to free speech, legal, legislative and technical possibilities for, and limits to, regulation. Panelists participated as resource persons in the following concurrent seminars that explored in more depth the issues and challenges raised in the plenary. The Legal/Legislative Seminar reviewed legal options and limits of Canadian legislation in dealing with hate on the Internet, as well as the complementary uses of human rights codes and the efficacy of such legislation. The Technical Seminar focused on the technical limits to regulating the Internet and the various roles and responsibilities of Internet service providers in bringing about regulatory and/or voluntary non-regulatory measures. In the Philosophical Seminar, there was a lively discussion of regulated versus unrestricted free speech on the Internet, with a focus on the effect either would have on the rights of both hate propagators and victim groups.

Professor Deborah Lipstadt of Emory University gave a special luncheon address on the topic "Holocaust Denial: at the Center of the Web of Hate" based on her extensive research of deniers and their close connections to other forms of hate mongering. Dr. Lipstadt's presentation provided insights into the modus operandi of anti-Semites and racists, and the challenges their pseudo-science currently pose to the academic and human rights communities worldwide.

A second round of concurrent workshops provided participants with an opportunity to share effective, practical and proactive strategies for countering both hate on the Internet and its impact. In "Grassroots Strategies to Deal with Hate," the role of community groups and individuals in moving the issue of hate on the Internet to the forefront was discussed, along

with ways to use to Internet to diffuse hatred and to promote human rights. In "Creating Communities and Promoting Intercultural Understanding," presenters discussed the ways in which the Internet can be used to provide information, debunk myths and stereotypes and promote partnerships and community cooperation in the "global village." Whether the Internet is just another form of commercially driven media that promotes violence, sexism and propaganda, or whether it is qualitatively different, and the implications of the Internet for educators, parents and the media were explored in "Is the Medium the Message?" "The New Rhetoric of Hate" featured a discussion of the use of academic, and particularly psychological, socio-biological research and language by members of the far right and neo-Nazis to formalize and legitimize hate propaganda on the Internet and elsewhere. Police personnel and prosecutors attended a closed session which provided an overview of hate groups and hate activity in Canada, international connections, and implications for criminal investigations and prosecutions.

One of the highlights of the symposium was a PBS-style forum, held at the North York Council Chambers on Monday evening, September 8th. Moderated by Neil MacDonald of CBC Newsworld, and open to the general public, this program featured a lively and provocative "rapid fire" discussion about the problem of hate on the Internet and how to counter it. Panelists included Canadian and international experts representing a variety of philosophical perspectives and areas of professional expertise.

Networking and building relationships was a critical part of the symposium, and the "Networking Lunch" on the final day of the program was designated specifically for this purpose. In addition to meeting informally with old and new colleagues, delegates were able to visit material resource displays set up by community multicultural and race relations organizations, government agencies, the Canadian Human Rights Commission, civil liberties groups, and computer and media volunteer associations, in order to learn more about grassroots human rights initiatives, share resources, and develop partnerships.

Final Workshops and Closing Plenary

All participants had received a discussion paper by David Matas, entitled "Countering Hate on the Internet: Recommendations for Action" and were asked to review the paper and fourteen proposed recommendations prior to the final day of the symposium. The task of the workshops was to come up with constructive recommendations based on the deliberations of the previous days. The workshops, facilitated by participants with relevant expertise, dealt with four substantive areas outlined in the Matas paper, including: 1) legal/legislative regulatory measures; 2) voluntary non-regulatory measures; 3) role of police; and 4) educational/pro-active initiatives. The discussion of the recommendations of the workshop groups was restricted to points of clarification, and all recommendations were recorded as reported to the final plenary.

The following recommendations were presented by the four workshop groups at the closing plenary of the International Symposium on Hate on the Internet, hosted by the League for Human Rights and the Institute for International Affairs of B'nai Brith Canada, September 9, 1997:

RECOMMENDATIONS

Legal/Legislative Regulatory Measures

This workshop group provided a preamble to their recommendations which were divided into two categories: Canadian and International.

Preamble:

> Hate crimes are not victimless, therefore legal remedies should continue to be available.
> There was a consensus not to introduce new measures to regulate the Internet, but that laws and international standards that exist against hate should be applied.

In Canada it is recommended that:

1. The criminal code should be maintained as presently drafted.
2. The Human Rights Acts should be revisited, particularly definitions, in order to update sections in terms of new technology, to avoid hate going unpunished because of a technicality.
3. All relevant acts (e.g. telecommunications, customs/tariff, postal, etc.) to update the language to include new technology.

Internationally it is recommended that:

4. Other international agreements should be examined (e.g. air piracy prosecutions) with a view to exploring amendments to the criminal code so Canada could accept jurisdiction of the Internet where appropriate.
5. All international standards that are in place (e.g. U.N. Convention Against All Forms of Discrimination, etc.) should be implemented by all countries who are signatories.
6. Canada should urge the U.N. Commission on Human Rights to declare that hate on the Internet is a global problem, and that the U.N. should move to marginalize hate in all its forms.
7. International unions (e.g. Postal) should be encouraged to amend/update their mandates and language of their regulations and jurisdictions to take new technology into account.

Voluntary Non-Regulatory Measures

It is recommended that:

1. Organizations which are committed to combatting hate on the Internet should compile a list of hate sites which they then should encourage institutions to block.

2. Software should be developed to allow the labelling of hate sites as hate sites; once developed, the use of such software should be encouraged.
3. Internet Service Providers should be asked to adopt codes of conduct which would exclude provision of services, including hosting of hate sites and e-mail accounts, to those who use the Internet to promote hatred.
4. A standard provision should be included in ISP contracts with users against the use of their services to promote hatred, with violations of such a provision resulting in the termination of contracts and denial of services.
5. B'nai Brith, in concert with organizations committed to combatting hatred on the Internet, should establish contact with the Responsible Use of the Net working group of the ISOC and other groups involved in the development of guidelines for Internet use.

Role of Police

The workshop group of police personnel made the following recommendations:

1. There should be greater recognition of and increased awareness of the profound victimization of hate and training for strategies to better serve victims of hate.
2. Police services should network, via the Internet, with victim groups, anti-hate groups, and those who can provide victim services.
3. The use of cease and desist requests should be explored and applied to those known to promote hate via the Internet.
4. The use of diversion programs should also be explored and applied where appropriate.
5. The Solicitors General (federal and provincial) should be approached to provide the both the policy development and financial support for technical assistance and training to be provided to police personnel to aid in identifying suspects who promote hate on the internet.
6. All police services should actively enforce and be seen to be enforcing the anti-hate laws.
7. The Criminal Code should be amended to include all categories of victim groups currently included in the sentencing enhancement section (as amended by Bill C-41).
8. Regulations should be encouraged to keep people accountable (e.g. service providers should be required to keep a log)
9. Police personnel and policy makers should address and involve all victim groups in practical strategies and policy development to deal with hate crime.
10. Hate groups should be included in guidelines on Criminal Organizations.
11. Hate groups should be included in "proceeds of crime" legislations (e.g. seizing assets).
12. Police personnel should work with anti-hate organizations to develop and encourage preventative strategies for victim groups.

Educational Proactive Initiatives

It is recommended that:

1. Students should be involved in future such meetings on the issue.
2. A conference should be planned for youth on this issue.
3. A leadership-training program should be established for peer counselling programs on hate on the Internet to be implemented in schools.

4. A video and/or CD Rom (similar to the ADL Video "Crimes of Hate") should be developed that emphasizes victim impact of hate propaganda, with testimonies of victims of hate, racism, anti-Semitism, etc.
5. Government resources should be allocated to enhance non-profit anti-hate networks.
6. Organizations involved in anti-hate work should be linked and encouraged to share resources, including international proactive co-operation.
7. Government should be lobbied to provide more information and statistics on immigration, anti-racism, to counter the impact of propaganda on the net.
8. The media should be provided with special briefings and encouraged to advance public education and awareness of hate mongering and hate propaganda.
9. Governments, schools and organizations should continue producing non-internet anti-hate, anti-racist educational materials and initiatives (e.g. films, videos) because Internet not completely accessible.
10. Anti-racism training must be provided for teachers and administrators.
11. Courses should be provided in school on media and computer literacy, including strategies to recognize bias and hate propaganda.
12. The Education Curriculum Clearinghouse should be contacted by anti-racism organizations to share curricula on anti-hate and anti-propaganda issues.
13. It should be suggested to computer hardware companies that they include anti-hate/anti-racist games and cartoons with the software that they automatically install in new products, to help young people recognize hate and propaganda on the internet.
14. A variety of media should be used to educate parents and parent councils about hate on the Internet.
15. Anti-hate organizations should reach out to 'mainstream' youth groups to increase awareness of hate propaganda and how to counter the recruitment activities of hate mongers.
16. There should be a website created for the International Symposium on Hate on the Internet, including the recommendations, a list of contacts and relevant websites and other resources.

The Second International Symposium - March, 1999

It was the consensus of all those present that the recommendations be communicated to all levels of government, to all relevant departments and jurisdictions, and to all participants to pass on to anyone who was interested or whom they felt could make a difference. It was also agreed that a complete list of all participants should be sent out as soon as possible, to facilitate networking and further co-operation. A vote of thanks was given to B'nai Brith for organizing the symposium, and there was unanimous agreement of all those present at the final plenary that B'nai Brith Canada should reconvene all participants in 18 months time to another symposium, to assess the progress of implementation of the recommendations, and to develop ongoing strategies to co-operate in countering hate on the Internet.

Speakers and Chairs
International Symposium on Hate on the Internet
Sponsored by:
The Institute for International Affairs and the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada

Harry Abrams is an advertising executive and community activist in Victoria, British Columbia. He serves as the Chair of the League for Human Rights in British Columbia. In 1995, Mr. Abrams received a commendation for volunteer research on hate on the Internet.

Alan Adel is the Vice Chair of the League for Human Rights. He holds both law and MBA degrees from McGill University, and also serves as legal counsel for B'nai Brith Canada. He is a member of the Lord Reading Law Society and member of the Court of Quebec Liaison Committee with the Montreal Bar.

Lisa Armony is the National Director of the Institute for International Affairs of B'nai Brith Canada. Her area of specialized study has been international relations, with a focus on Israeli foreign policy. She has also served as the Community Liaison for the National Jewish Community Relations Advisory Council in New York.

Prof. Aurel Braun is a Professor of International Relations and Political Science at the University of Toronto. He is also a Research Associate of the Centre for Russian and East European Studies and of the Centre for International Studies at the University of Toronto. He has published and lectured widely on communist affairs and strategic studies with a special focus on the problems of the transformation of the socialist systems in the former Soviet Union and in Eastern Europe.

Michael Bernstein is the Deputy Director (Prosecutions) for the Crown Law Office - Criminal for the Ministry of the Attorney General for Ontario. He is responsible for a variety of matters, including the review, assignment and supervision of prosecutions conducted by Crown Counsel in his office. He is a designated resource person and a co-ordinator for the Ministry in the area of Hate Propaganda and Bias Motivated Offences. He has lectured extensively in this area.

A. Alan Borovoy has served as the General Counsel of the Canadian Civil Liberties Association since 1968. Between 1992 and 1996, he was a fortnightly columnist for the Toronto Star. He has a long history of involvement on a professional and personal level with human rights organizations, including the National Committee for Human Rights of the Canadian Labour Congress and the Ontario Committee for human rights. He has frequently appeared in the media, commenting on a variety of issues, and has authored numerous publications, including two books, When Freedoms Collide – A Case for our Civil Liberties, and Uncivil Obedience – The Tactics and Tales of a Democratic Agitator. In 1982, he was made an Officer of the Order of Canada, and has been awarded four honorary Doctor of Laws Degrees.

Irwin Cotler is a Professor of Law at McGill University and a member of its Institute of Comparative Law and Centre for Medicine, Ethics and Law. He is the recipient of Honorary Doctorates from Bar-Ilan, Simon Fraser, Hebrew, Haifa, and York Universities. A constitutional and comparative law scholar, he has litigated every section of the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, including landmark cases in the areas of free speech, women's rights, minority rights, war crimes justice, and peace law. As an international human rights lawyer, he served as Counsel to former Prisoners of Conscience in the former Soviet Union, South Africa, and Latin America. A noted peace activist, Prof. Cotler has been a leader in the movement for arms control, and has helped to develop "Peace Law" as an area of both academic inquiry and legal advocacy. In 1992, he was appointed as an Officer of the Order of Canada.

Frank Dimant is the Executive Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada and the CEO of the League for Human Rights and the Institute for International Affairs. He has worked extensively on behalf of victims of human rights abuses, and has actively worked with government and community leaders in the battle against hate crime activity in this country and overseas.

Detective Dino Doria has been with the Metropolitan Toronto Police Force for 22 years. He serves with the Intelligence Unit as a detective with the Hate Crimes Unit.

Rose A. Dyson, Ed.D. is a self-employed consultant in media education. She is the chairperson of Canadians Concerned About Violence in Entertainment (C-CAVE). She works closely with George Gerbner, Dean Emeritus of the Annenberg School of Communications at the University of Pennsylvania and founder of the Cultural Environment Movement (CEM). She is the only Canadian elected to serve on the Executive Committee of the CEM Board of Directors. Dr. Dyson has been involved in numerous media consultations to both industry and government, including the Canadian Association of Broadcasters and the Canadian Broadcast Standards Council. She is currently writing a book on media violence, and is associate editor and a frequent contributor to Peace Magazine.

Pearl Elman has a Masters degree with special interest in women in Judaism. She is active in the Women's Interfaith Dialogue Program of the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada.

Dr. Hedy Fry has been the Secretary of State (Multiculturalism)(Status of Women) since 1996, re-appointed after the 1997 Federal Election. She is the Member of Parliament for Vancouver Central. Prior to her election, she was a medical practitioner.

David Goldman is founder and director of HateWatch, a web-based organization dedicated to combating and combatting the spread of hate on the Internet. HateWatch is a resource for academics, activists and community members to access up-to-date information on the "state of hate" on the Internet.

Dr. Lawrence E. Hart is an Associate Professor of Medicine at McMaster University in Hamilton, Ontario. He is Senior Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada and National Chair of the Institute for International Affairs.

David Hoffman has worked for the Anti-Defamation League (ADL) since 1995 as a Research Analyst tracking extremists and hate group activity on the Internet. In that time he has written several reports, including "Hate Groups Recruitment on the Internet," "The Web of Hate: Extremists Exploit the Internet," and "ADL Backgrounder – Extremism on the Internet." Currently, he is working on an update of "The Web of Hate" that will be published this fall under the title "Hi-Tech Hate". Mr. Hoffman has recently been appointed Webmaster for the ADL website.

Jeremy Jones is the Director of International and Community Affairs of the Australia/Israel and Jewish Affairs Council. He holds the honorary position of Executive Vice President of the Executive Council of Australian Jewry and is also the convenor of the Advisory Group of Faith Communities to the Council for Aboriginal Reconciliation and a member of the New South Wales Government's Social Justice Reference Group. He is a member of the Jewish Community-Uniting Church Dialogue Group, the New South Wales Anti-Discrimination Board's Community Consultation Group, the Executive of the New South Wales Jewish Board of Deputies, and is an honorary life member of the Australasian Union of Jewish Students. Amongst other offices he currently holds are Australia and Asia/Pacific correspondent for the Jewish Telegraphic Agency, Sydney correspondent for the Jerusalem Report, and Research Associate of the Macquarie University Centre for Comparative Genocide Studies.

Ron Kawchuk is the President of the Canadian Association of Internet Providers. He was a pioneer in several Canadian telecommunications industry innovations, including Mach/Mega services, electronic mail, network outsourcing, sharing/resale, voice/data integration, local services pricing and Internet related access services. Mr. Kawchuk has over 25 years of telecommunications industry experience in both large end-user and vendor environments, having worked at IBM, Bell Canada, BNR Inc., Unitel and ISM. He led the coalition called HALT, Halt All Local Tolls, a group focused on awareness, education, and advocacy with respect to pay-per-call or local measured service in Canada. Recent assignments include wireless (LCMS & PCS), Internet and regulatory related projects.

Marvin Kurz is the National Legal Counsel for the League for Human Rights. A partner in the Brampton law firm of Dale, Streiman and Kurz, he has appeared before the Deschenes Commission on War Criminals, has intervened on the League's behalf in such cases as Malcolm Ross and the Somalia Inquiry, and is currently acting as counsel for the League at the Human Rights Tribunal of Ernst Zundel.

Evan Liebovitch is the president of Sound Software, a Unix, Linux and Internet services company located in Brampton Ontario. He has been heavily involved in getting B'nai Brith Canada wired to the Internet, and he has also been involved with the Nizkor project and other community Internet projects.

Sol Littman is a sociologist turned journalist and community relations worker who serves as the Canadian Representative of the Wiesenthal Centre. In that capacity he played a key in persuading the Canadian government to appoint a Commission of Inquiry on War Criminals in Canada (the Deschenes Commission) and to amend Canada's Criminal Code to allow the prosecution of war criminals for crimes committed beyond Canada's borders. Mr. Littman was a senior editorial writer with the Toronto Star, and has since written two books, War Criminal on Trial, and The Trizub and the Swastika, the history of a Ukrainian Waffen-SS Division that, to be published next Spring.

Dr. Deborah E. Lipstadt is Dorot Professor of Modern Jewish and Holocaust Studies at Emory University in Atlanta. Her latest book Denying the Holocaust: The Growing Assault on Truth and Memory, is the first full length study of the history of those who attempt to deny the Holocaust. She has also written Beyond Belief: The American Press and the Coming of the Holocaust. Dr. Lipstadt was a historical consultant to the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum where she helped design the section of the Museum dedicated to the American response to the Holocaust. In 1994 she was appointed by President Clinton to serve on the United States Holocaust Memorial Council. In 1996 she was appointed by the Secretary of State to the newly formed Advisory Committee on Religious Freedom Abroad.

Neil MacDonald has been a reporter and editor for the last 21 years. He has worked at the Ottawa Citizen, the Montreal Gazette and the Vancouver Sun. He has been with the CBC for the past ten years. He has been a parliamentary reporter for 13 of his years in media, and spent two years with the documentary unit at the CBC. He has focused extensively on Nazi War Criminals, and has the distinction being sued by two veterans of the Galician (Ukranian) SS Division.

David Matas is a noted immigration and refugee lawyer, a past National Chair of the League for Human Rights, and a current Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada. He also serves as Senior Honorary Counsel of B'nai Brith Canada. A native of Winnipeg, he has worked with Amnesty International and Helsinki Watch, and has written books on several subjects, including Nazi war criminals in Canada titled Justice Delayed.

Kenneth McVay has been a leader in developing and carrying out community based and grass roots strategies for countering the lies of Holocaust deniers on the Internet. Mr. McVay is the Director of the

Nizkor Project, which is a Holocaust-resource website that has proven to be an invaluable tool for researchers and students. In recognition of the value of McVay's work, he was awarded the Order of British Columbia in 1995, and he was presented with a special Media Human Rights Award by B'nai Brith Canada in 1996.

Jim Mercer is a Network Architect who provides technical advice in the area of implementing and integrating Internet facilities.

Dr. Karen Mock is the National Director of the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada. She is a registered psychologist and educator, specializing in interpersonal communication, multiculturalism, and race relations. Dr. Mock has lectured and published widely on human rights, multiculturalism and anti-racist education, and she has directed several projects on racism and hate group activity in Canada. Dr. Mock is past president of the Ontario Multicultural Association (OMAMO) and is the past chair of the Canadian Multiculturalism Advisory Committee to the Secretary of State.

William F. Pentney is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Law and Acting Director of the Human Rights Research and Education Centre at the University of Ottawa. He is currently General Counsel and Director of Legal Services at the Canadian Human Rights Commission. He has represented the Commission in cases in the Federal Court and Supreme Court of Canada. He has published the revised edition of Discrimination and the Law in Canada and is the co-author of Human Rights in Canada: Cases, Notes and Materials.

Valmond Romilly is the National Chair of the Harambee Foundation, which delivers culturally sensitive services to members of the Black community. He is also a lawyer in private practice in Vancouve, British Columbia.

Richard S. Rosenberg is an Associate Professor with the Department of Computer Science at the University of British Columbia. His research and writing have focused on the interrelationship between computers and society, including privacy, free speech, intellectual property rights, access, work and education, as well as artificial intelligence. Mr. Rosenberg is also the Vice President of Electronic Frontier Canada and the Editor of the SIGCAS Newsletter.

Mark Sandler is an Honorary Senior Legal Counsel for the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada. A noted criminal lawyer in Toronto, he is a partner in the law firm of Cooper, Sandler and West. Mr. Sandler appeared on behalf of the League before the Supreme Court of Canada in the cases of Zundel v. The Queen, R. v. Keegstra, and Smith and Andrews v. the Queen. He is on faculty at the Osgoode Law School. Mr. Sandler is currently acting as the Associate Commission Counsel to the Guy Paul Morin Inquiry. He is the author, with his wife Fern Weinper, of Criminal Procedure: Cases, Notes and Materials.

Ingrid Shafer, a native of Innsbruck, Austria is Professor of Philosophy and Religion and Mary Jo Ragan Professor of Inter-disciplinary Studies at the University of Science and Arts of Oklahoma. Shafer "owns" and moderates several Internet discussion forums, including "G-ethic", dedicated to developing a global ethic. She is also creator/editor of several websites designed to foster dialogue among diverse groups and combat intolerance of any time. Shafer is an Associate of the Chicago Centre of Religion and Science and serves on the Global Dialogue Institute (GDC) Program Development Committee.

Lyle Smordin is the National President of B'nai Brith Canada. He is a senior partner with the law firm of Smordin, Pauls, based in Winnipeg. He is a past National Chair of the League for Human Rights, and a past Vice President and Senior Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada.

Michael P. Stein is a computer programmer and musician from Arlington, VA. He first became interested in the subject of Holocaust denial in April 1994 when he came across denial messages on Usenet. He has worked with the Nizkor Project to produce answers to some specific denial claims. He has had extensive private correspondence with many deniers. Based on these contacts, he has developed a more complex view of what makes them tick, besides simple antisemitism.

Nadine Strossen, Professor of Law at New York Law School since 1988, has written, lectured, and practised extensively in the areas of constitutional law, civil liberties and international human rights. In 1991, she was elected President of the American Civil Liberties Union, the first woman to head America's largest and oldest civil liberties organization. In 1991 and 1994, the National Law Journal included Professor Strossen in its triennial special section, "Profiles in Power: the 100 Most Influential Lawyers in America." She has served on the boards of directors of many human rights organizations, and has authored and co-authored numerous publications, including Defending Pornography: Free Speech, Sex, and the Fight for Women's Rights.

Kenneth Swan is a lawyer, arbitrator and mediator in the city of Toronto. He is the Vice President of the Canadian Civil Liberties Association and former Chair of the National Board of Directors.

Eddie Taylor is Legal Counsel for the Canadian Human Rights Commission in Ottawa. He is an Adjunct Professor of Law with the Faculty of Law at the University of Ottawa. He has earned a reputation as a top anti-hate advocate, serving as counsel in cases against hate groups including the Heritage Front, the Ku Klux Klan and Liberty Net, before the Human Rights Tribunal, the Federal Courts, and the Supreme Court of Canada. Mr. Taylor has written widely on human rights issues, publishing in the areas of freedom of expression, hate propaganda, racial discrimination, and disability rights.

Prof. Mark Webber, with degrees in German Language and Literature from Harvard College and Yale University, teaches German Studies at York University, where he directs The Canadian Centre for German and European Studies. He has published in the fields of German literary history, Holocaust studies, and intercultural understanding between Germans and North Americans. He is currently a member of the National Cabinet of the League for Human Rights and the Institute for International Affairs of B'nai Brith Canada. In 1993 the President of the Federal Republic of Germany awarded Mark Webber the Officer's Cross of the Federal Order of Merit (the German equivalent of the Order of Canada) for his scholarly and cultural contributions to increasing understanding between Germans and Canadians. He has just returned from ten months' research leave at the University of Konstanz in Germany.

Dr. Andrew S. Winston is Professor of Psychology at the University of Guelph, and specializes in the history of psychology and the psychology of art. His recent publications have analyzed the history of antisemitism in academic psychology and the use of psychological research on race by neo-fascist groups.

Kriminaldirektor Sigurd Werner has headed the police unit responsible for countering terrorism, anti-democratic movements (particularly right-wing extremism) and espionage in Wurttemberg, Germany for the past two years. In his 32 years with the Baden-Wurttemberg police, Mr. Werner has been involved in investigating organized crime and developing international co-operation between police agencies. He has spearheaded the initiative to develop a joint German-French police service, and in 1992-93 played a leading role in building up the coordinating body for the European police force Europol.

Rochelle Wilner is the National Chair of the League for Human Rights. A former teacher and tireless community volunteer, Ms. Wilner has spearheaded the League's recent public education programs in Holocaust education, anti-racism and diversity training. She is a past National Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada.

Mervin Witter is the Director of the Ontario Region of the Canadian Human Rights Commission.

Ottawa to target hatred on Internet

BY PETER EDWARDS
STAFF REPORTER

Nineteen federal departments and agencies are working on an action plan to fight hate crime on the Internet, an international symposium has heard.

The announcement was made last night by Multiculturalism Secretary of State Hedy Fry to lawmakers, law enforcers, academics and educators at a B'nai Brith symposium at Metro Hall.

"I think it's time that we stop denying the existence of hatred," Fry said.

Co-operation between different countries and different groups in society is vital to battling the spread of right-wing extremism on the Internet, Fry said.

"It defies walls. It defies borders."

Canada's greatness is built upon tolerance and respect for different people, and this is threatened by hate groups using the Internet, Fry added.

Toronto Mayor Barbara Hall told the gathering she hopes that a case to be heard by the Canadian Human Rights Commission next month gives teeth to law enforcement groups battling hate crime on the Internet.

Hall said she hopes the commission establishes a precedent and determines that using the Internet to spread hatred violates laws against spreading hate by telephone lines.

"The value of the Internet as a tool to promote democracy and human rights is astounding," said Lyle Smordin, national president of B'nai Brith Canada.

"Unfortunately, the same technology also allows for the spread of hatred and the encouragement of violence against identifiable groups," Smordin said.

"The international nature of the Internet requires that a concerted effort is made to create international co-operation in dealing with the new issues that arise from this method of communication," symposium co-chair Lawrence Hart said.

"Our challenge in a democratic society, as always in human rights issues, is to balance the right to freedom of speech with the right to be free from being the object of hatred and the violence that flows from it," said David Matas, symposium co-chair.

TORONTO STAR SEPT. 8, 1997

CANADA

Conference calls for tough laws to stop hate material on Internet

The Canadian Press

TORONTO — The Criminal Code should be amended so Canada could prosecute offenders who transmit hate material on the Internet from inside the country, an international symposium was told yesterday.

A legal solution to the issue would likely be more realistic than trying to screen out offending Web sites, said Alan Adel, vice-chairman of the League for Human Rights.

"Canada has in many cases taken the lead on the international scene," particularly in the sphere of human rights, Mr. Adel said, speaking at a B'nai Brith conference.

OTTAWA CITIZEN SEPT. 9, 1997

B'nai Brith Hosts Symposium

Toronto--With Hate Groups having found a new home on the World Wide Web, an explosion of highly sophisticated Websites are peddling the propaganda of hatemongers and posing new and dangerous challenges to human rights worldwide.

A first step toward developing strategies to deal with hate on the internet and counter its impact was the recent International Symposium on Hate on the Internet hosted by B'nai Brith Canada.

In cooperation with B'nai Brith International and co-Chaired by Dr. Lawrence Hart, National Chair of the Institute for International Affairs and Rochelle Wilner, National Chair of the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada, Canadian and international government and police officials and experts in the field of law/legislation, human rights, computer technology, education and community action came together September 7th to the 9th, to explore possible solutions.

"The value of the internet as a tool to promote democracy and human rights is astounding. Unfortunately, the same technology also allows for the spread of hatred and the encouragement of violence against identifiable groups." said Lyle Smordin, National President of B'nai Brith Canada. "The internet links scholars from around the world furthering the cause of science and knowledge, yet this same technology also links extremists thus furthering their cause with the same speed and efficiency. Those committed to combating hatred, racism and xenophobia must use the internet to further the cause of justice with the same fervor as those who would seek to undermine our fundamental values."

Frank Dimant, Executive Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada added: "Whether hate is pontificated to thousands at a mass rally, distributed in the form of pamphlets or transmitted over the phone lines as an Internet Website, usenet or email and whether it is in the form of Holocaust denial, anti-Zionist rhetoric or straight blatant anti-Jewish slander, the ramifications to the Jewish community are devastating. As a people, we have fought anti-Semitism through the ages and must continue to do so wherever it may be and in whatever form it takes."

The Tribune-September 23, 1997

B'nai Brith Hosts International Symposium On "Hate On The Internet"

By Steven Mock

The International Symposium on Hate on the Internet got off to an explosive start on Sunday. In the opening, a panel of experts on hate crimes and civil liberties squared-off over the issue that would underlie the conference: how to balance freedom of speech with the protection of minorities.

It was agreed both by those on both sides of the question that the new technology of the Internet did not alter this basic philosophical issue.

"I don't think the analysis changes when you talk about a new communications medium," said Professor Nadine Strossen, National President of the American Civil Liberties Union.

Alan Borovoy, General Counsel to the Canadian Civil Liberties Association, agreed. "Those of us opposed to the anti-hate law as applied to speeches, books and pamphlets are no less opposed to it as applied to the Internet, for us the dominant issue has always been freedom of speech."

"Internet or no Internet, the wise policy against hatemongers should not be to muzzle them but marginalize them, as far as I'm concerned the advent of the Internet should not alter our position one bit."

Professor Strossen added that if anything, the Internet technology strengthens this position since, "counter-speech is so much more effectively engaged in." She cited grassroots efforts such as the Nizkor project, an on-line resource for documents relating to the Holocaust and Holocaust-denial, as examples.

"Our steadfast opposition to censoring hate speech lies at least as much in our belief in the goals of anti-discrimination as the goals of free speech. Censoring hate speech would do more harm than good to the goals of equality."

She stated that it is paradoxical for marginalized groups to turn to the system for protection, pointing out that, in the past, hate speech laws, once enacted, have been used against minorities. "Minority groups are inevitably the ones whose speech is deemed hate speech."

Professor Irwin Cotler, of the Faculty of Law at McGill University disagreed, stating that hate speech laws prevent minorities from feeling marginalized. "Should a government choose not to enact any prohibitions against hate speech, it appears that minority issues public response."

For Sigurd Werner, in charge of hate crimes and counter-terrorism in the German province of Baden-Wurrtemberg, the problem was too immediate to be dealt with on strictly a philosophical level.

"We have a responsibility to our citizens and to foreign nationals living in Baden Wurrtemberg. We must protect the younger generation from the propaganda influence of the neo-Nazis.

The Internet has made the enforcement of German laws against hate propaganda problematic." The neo-Nazis, he explained, "use mostly the U.S. and other countries such as Sweden to distribute their propaganda because they know it is against German law."

> "...an obscenity more malevolent than Holocaust denial..."

In his opinion, a solution would have to involve a harmonization of hate-speech laws in the European Union, as well as world-wide cooperation in monitoring the Internet.

Jeremey Jones, Executive Vice-President of the Council of Australian Jewry identified a similar problem in his country. "Its important to remember that we are talking about an international problem, we (in Australia) have to deal with the consequences of American originated and defended hate material."

However, he agreed that the technology does not alter the principle behind the law itself, but merely the method by which it is to be enforced. "What is legal outside the Internet has to be legal on the Internet. What is illegal outside the Internet should be illegal on the Internet."

Alan Borovoy pointed out that philosophical problems inherent in enforcing such laws remain the same. "It would be hard to imagine an obscenity more malevolent than Holocaust denial, but how do you write a law so beautifully focused that you are going to catch that one awful, unredeemed hate speech without running the terrible risk of catching a lot of other speech in the same net?"

The three-day symposium, organized by the League for Human Rights and Institute for International Affairs of B'nai Brith Canada, was designed to bring together experts and community leaders from around the world to determine an appropriate method for dealing with this insidious new form of hate propaganda.

The Jewish Tribune September 11, 1
Page 15

Ottawa to target hatred on Internet

BY PETER EDWARDS
STAFF REPORTER

Nineteen federal departments and agencies are working on an action plan to fight hate crime on the Internet, an international symposium has heard.

The announcement was made last night by Multiculturalism Secretary of State Hedy Fry to lawmakers, law enforcers, academics and educators at a B'nai Brith symposium at Metro Hall.

"I think it's time that we stop denying the existence of hatred," Fry said.

Co-operation between different countries and different groups in society is vital to battling the spread of right-wing extremism on the Internet, Fry said.

"It defies walls. It defies borders."

Canada's greatness is built upon tolerance and respect for different people, and this is threatened by hate groups using the Internet, Fry added.

Toronto Mayor Barbara Hall told the gathering she hopes that a case to be heard by the Canadian Human Rights Commission next month gives teeth to law enforcement groups battling hate crime on the Internet.

Hall said she hopes the commission establishes a precedent and determines that using the Internet to spread hatred violates laws against spreading hate by telephone lines.

"The value of the Internet as a tool to promote democracy and human rights is astounding," said Lyle Smordin, national president of B'nai Brith Canada.

"Unfortunately, the same technology also allows for the spread of hatred and the encouragement of violence against identifiable groups," Smordin said.

"The international nature of the Internet requires that a concerted effort is made to create international co-operation in dealing with the new issues that arise from this method of communication," symposium co-chair Lawrence Hart said.

"Our challenge in a democratic society, as always in human rights issues, is to balance the right to freedom of speech with the right to be free from being the object of hatred and the violence that flows from it," said David Matas, symposium co-chair.

TORONTO STAR SEPT. 8, 1997

CANADA

Conference calls for tough laws o stop hate material on Internet

The Canadian Press

ORONTO — The Criminal Code ld be amended so Canada could ecute offenders who transmit material on the Internet from ide the country, an international posium was told yesterday.

legal solution to the issue would likely be more realistic than trying to screen out offending Web sites, said Alan Adel, vice-chairman of the League for Human Rights.

"Canada has in many cases taken the lead on the international scene," particularly in the sphere of human rights, Mr. Adel said, speaking at a B'nai Brith conference.

OTTAWA CITIZEN SEPT. 4, 1997

B'nai Brith Hosts Symposium

Toronto--With Hate Groups having found a new home on the World Wide Web, an explosion of highly sophisticated Websites are peddling the propaganda of hatemongers and posing new and dangerous challenges to human rights worldwide.

A first step toward developing strategies to deal with hate on the internet and counter its impact was the recent International Sympoeium on Hate on the Internet hosted by B'nai Brith Canada.

In cooperation with B'nai Brith International and co-Chaired by Dr. Lawrence Hart, National Chair of the Institute for International Affairs and Rochelle Wilner, National Chair of the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith Canada, Canadian and international government and police officials and experts in the field of law/legislation, human rights, computer technology, education and community action came together September 7th to the 9th, to explore possible solutions.

The value of the internet as a tool to promote democracy and human rights is astounding. Unfortunately, the same technology also allows for the spread of hatred and the encouragement of violence against identifiable groups," said Lyle Smordin, National President of B'nai Brith Canada. "The internet links scholars from around the world furthering the cause of science and knowledge, yet this same technology also links extremists thus furthering their cause with the same speed and efficiency. Those committed to combating hatred, racism and xenophobia must use the internet to further the cause of justice with the same fervor as those who would seek to undermine our fundamental values."

Frank Dimant, Executive Vice President of B'nai Brith Canada added: "Whether hate is pontificated to thousands at a mass rally, distributed in the form of pamphlets or transmitted over the phone lines as an Internet Website, usenet or email and whether it is in the form of Holocaust denial, anti-Zionist rhetoric or straight blatant anti-Jewish slander, the ramifications to the Jewish community are devastating. As a people, we have fought anti-Semitism through the ages and must continue to do so wherever it may be and in whatever form it takes."

The Tribune September 21, 1997

B'nai Brith Hosts International Symposium On "Hate On The Internet"

By Steven Mock

The International Symposium on Hate on the Internet got off to an explosive start on Sunday. In the opening, a panel of experts on hate crimes and civil liberties squared-off over the issue that would underlie the conference: how to balance freedom of speech with the protection of minorities.

It was agreed both by those on both sides of the question that the new technology of the Internet did not alter this basic philosophical issue.

"I don't think the analysis changes when you talk about a new communications medium," said Professor Nadine Strossen, National President of the American Civil Liberties Union.

Alan Borovoy, General Counsel to the Canadian Civil Liberties Association, agreed. "Those of us opposed to the anti-hate law as applied to speeches, books and pamphlets are no less opposed to it as applied to the Internet, for us the dominant issue has always been freedom of speech."

"Internet or no Internet, the wise policy against hatemongers should not be to muzzle them but marginalize them, as far as I'm concerned the advent of the Internet should not alter our position one bit."

Professor Strossen added that if anything, the Internet technology strengthens this position since, "counter-speech is so much more effectively engaged in." She cited grassroots efforts such as the Nizkor project, an on-line resource for documents relating to the Holocaust and Holocaust-denial, as examples.

"Our steadfast opposition to censoring hate speech lies at least as much in our belief in the goals of anti-discrimination as the goals of free speech. Censoring hate speech would do more harm than good to the goals of equality."

She stated that it is paradoxical for marginalized groups to turn to the system for protection, pointing out that, in the past, hate speech laws, once enacted, have been used against minorities. "Minority groups are inevitably the ones whose speech is deemed hate speech."

Professor Irwin Cotler, of the Faculty of Law at McGill University disagreed, stating that hate speech laws prevent minorities from feeling marginalized. "Should a government choose not to enact any prohibitions against hate speech, it appears that minority issues public response."

For Sigurd Werner, in charge of hate crimes and counter-terrorism in the German province of Baden-Wurrtemberg, the problem was too immediate to be dealt with on strictly a philosophical level.

"We have a responsibility to our citizens and to foreign nationals living in Baden Wurrtemberg. We must protect the younger generation from the propaganda influence of the neo-Nazis."

The Internet has made the enforcement of German laws against hate propaganda problematic." The neo-Nazis, he explained, "use mostly the U.S. and other countries such as Sweden to distribute their propaganda because they know it is against German law."

> "...an obscenity more malevolent than Holocaust denial..."

In his opinion, a solution would have to involve a harmonization of hate-speech laws in the European Union, as well as world-wide cooperation in monitoring the Internet.

Jeremey Jones, Executive Vice-President of the Council of Australian Jewry identified a similar problem in his country. "Its important to remember that we are talking about an international problem, we (in Australia) have to deal with the consequences of American originated and defended hate material."

However, he agreed that the technology does not alter the principle behind the law itself, but merely the method by which it is to be enforced. "What is legal outside the Internet has to be legal on the Internet. What is illegal outside the Internet should be illegal on the Internet."

Alan Borovoy pointed out that philosophical problems inherent in enforcing such laws remain the same. "It would be hard to imagine an obscenity more malevolent than Holocaust denial, but how do you write a law so beautifully focused that you are going to catch that one awful, unredeemed hate speech without running the terrible risk of catching a lot of other speech in the same net?"

The three-day symposium, organized by the League for Human Rights and Institute for International Affairs of B'nai Brith Canada, was designed to bring together experts and community leaders from around the world to determine an appropriate method for dealing with this insidious new form of hate propaganda.

The Jewish Tribune September 11, Page 15

The World Joins Forces for Hate On The Internet Symposium

Internet law criticized

The Criminal Code should be amended so Canada could prosecute offenders who transmit hate material on the Internet from outside the country, Alan Adel, vice-chairman of the League for Human Rights of B'nai Brith, told an international symposium in Toronto yesterday. A legal solution to the issue would likely be more realistic than trying to screen out offending Web sites, Mr. Adel said. Although the Canada's Criminal Code prohibits the dissemination of hate material in the country, the Internet is oblivious to international borders. — CP

GLOBE + MAIL
SEPT. 9, 1997

By Natasha Greenberg

TORONTO -- For three days in September, "the world" came together in Toronto to discuss and debate the issue of cyberhate. Participants in the International Symposium on Hate on the Internet, sponsored by B'nai Brith Canada, came from Germany, Australia, and all across continental North America to wrestle with an issue that continues to confound law makers, technicians, educators and philosophers.

The Symposium began with fireworks, as the heads of the Canadian Civil Liberties Association and the American Civil Liberties Union went head to head with a German Kriminaldirektor from Baden-Wurttemberg, a Professor of Law, and the Executive Vice President of the Executive Council of Australian Jewry. The audience of approximately 100 people were given the opportunity to participate, ask questions, and respond to the panelists, setting the tone of expertise mixed with give and take that marked the three days.

The significance of the issue of hate on the Internet was reaffirmed Sunday night with presence at a reception of not only the international experts, but members of every level of Canadian government, all of whom praised the initiative, and acknowledged the issue as a serious one.

By Monday, participants had launched fully into the programme, participating in plenaries as well as smaller workshops. The first workshops dealt in broad strokes with the technological, philosophical, and legal/legislative aspects of the issue of cyberhate. The lunch address was given by the well known author and academic in the area of Holocaust studies and Holocaust denial, Deborah Lipstadt. Afternoon workshops dealt with more specific topics, and gave all participants the opportunity to really contribute their feelings and expertise.

The Symposium was attended by a large component of police and RCMP officers, who were engaged in closed sessions that allowed them to really wrestle with the issues that are specific to their line of work. Again and again they repeated that hate activity on the Internet, like hate activity in other forms, is not a victimless crime. They more than anyone are aware of this, and want to make sure that this fact is not forgotten.

One of the most productive aspects of the Symposium was the opportunity it provided for networking and the forming of connections. By the second day, like-minded participants had found each other and were developing contacts that would extend far beyond the three days, to create a kind of international network to combat hate on the Internet. While there was no consensus on the issue of regulation of the Internet, the debate that occurred prodded all involved to really consider the basis of their position on the issue at hand. So successful was this effort that participants voted almost unanimously to reconvene in 18 months to see where these connections had led, and what concrete results had come of them.

The proceedings of the conference and the recommendations that came out of it will be available in the near future.

03/31/98 TUE 13:25 FAX 416 650 2159 B'Nai Brith

B'nai Brith Canada National Office
Institute for International Affairs
League for Human Rights
15 Hove Street
Toronto, Ontario M3H 4Y8
Tel.: (416)633-6224 Fax: (416) 630-2159
E-mail: bnb@bnaibrith.ca
Website: http://www.bnaibrith.ca

Eastern Region:
6900 Decarie Boulevard, Suite 219
Montreal, Quebec H3X 2T8
Tel.: (514) 733-5377
Fax: (514) 342-9632
E-mail: bnaibrith@total.net

Mid-Western Region:
123 Doncaster Street, Suite C403
Winnipeg, Manitoba R3N 2B2
Tel.: (204) 487-9623
Fax: (204) 487-9648
E-mail: bnaiwpg@ilos.net

National Capital Region
112 Kent Street, Suite 212
Ottawa, Ontario K1P 5P2
Tel.: (613) 789-4922

B'nai Brith International
1640 Rhode Island Avenue
New Washington, D.C.
United States of America
20036-3278
Tel.: (202) 857-6553 Fax: (202) 296-0638

Anti-Hate Hotline

If you or anyone you know has been the victim of antisemitism, racism, hate-motivated crime, or harassment, call:

1-800-892-2624 (remember: 1-800-892-BNAI)

This line will connect you directly with the B'nai Brith Canada National Office where you will receive, or be referred to, immediate attention.